

Question:

What do the ‘ulamā say concerning a person who is leading a prayer in which recitation is aloud, however he reads most of Sūrah al-Fātihah quietly then realizes his mistake and starts reading it again aloud?

Answer:

بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ
الجواب بِعَوْنِ الْمَلِكِ الْوَهَّابِ اللَّهُمَّ هِدَايَةَ الْحَقِّ وَالصَّوَابِ

Sajdah al-Sahw (prostration of forgetfulness) is wājib (necessary) on such a person, because firstly it was wājib upon him to recite Sūrah al-Fātihah in a manner of jahr (aloud) and he recited in a manner of sirr (quietly) and secondly he returned upon himself and started to recite Sūrah al-Fātihah a second time resulting in the repetition of a wājib, i.e. Sūrah al-Fātihah. Thus sajdah al-Sahw (prostration of forgetfulness) is wājib (necessary) upon him in this scenario as is mentioned in al-Durr al-Mukhtār:

(وَالْجَهْرُ فِيمَا يُخَافُ فِيهِ لِلْإِمَامِ (وَعَكْسُهُ)

“[sajdah al-sahw is necessary for] (loud recital in that prayer in which recital should be quiet) for the Imām (and vice versa)”

وَالْأَصْحَحُ تَقْدِيرُهُ (بِقَدْرِ مَا تَجُوزُ بِهِ الصَّلَاةُ...)

“And the most correct opinion in evaluation of the amount in consideration is (the amount by which prayer is validated...)”

[Radd al-Muhtār ala al-Durr al-Mukhtār vol 2 pg 81]

In Bahāre Sharī‘at it is mentioned:

“If any wājib of the prayer is left then in rectification of it’s loss sajdah al-sahw is wājib and it’s method is that two prostrations should be performed after giving salām to the right side after tashahhud, after which tashahhud is to be repeated and that which is after it should be recited and salām given [to conclude the prayer].”

[Bahāre Sharī‘at Volume 1 pg 708]

It is also mentioned:

“If the Imām quietly recited that amount by which the prayer is validated i.e. one ayah in a jahrī prayer [one in which recitation should be aloud], or recited aloud in a sirrī prayer [one in which recitation should be aloud] sajdah al-sahw is wājib upon him and if he recited one word quietly or aloud then this is forgiven.”

[Bahāre Sharʿīat Volume 1 pg 714]

Regarding the repetition of Sūrah al-Fātihah it is stated:

“If one had recited most of Sūrah Fātihah in the first two rakʿats and then one repeated it’s recital sajdah al-sahw is wājib.”

[Bahāre Sharʿīat Volume 1 pg 711]

والله تعالى اعلم ورسوله اعلم صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم

Answered by Muftī Muhammad Aslam al-Shīwānī al-Maymanī